

PROSIECT GWYRDD JOINT SCRUTINY PANEL

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD AT PENALLTA HOUSE, YSTRAD MYNACH
ON FRIDAY, 23RD NOVEMBER 2012 AT 10.00 A.M.**

Present:

Councillor R. McKerlich - Chairman (Cardiff County Council)

Councillors:

Councillor J. Bevan and C Elsbury (Caerphilly County Borough Council)

Councillor B. Derbyshire (Cardiff County Council)

Councillors S. Howarth and Ms V.E. Smith (Monmouthshire County Council)

Councillor M. Spencer (Newport City Council)

Councillors R. Traherne and A. Moore (Vale of Glamorgan Council)

Together with:

D. Perkins, J. Jones and C Forbes-Thompson (Caerphilly County Borough Council), R Bowen (Cardiff County Council) and H Ilett (Monmouthshire County Council)

Prosiect Gwyrdd Officers:

M. Williams (Project Director) and M. Falconer (Finance Manager)

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest received at the commencement or during the course of the meeting.

2. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor P. Hannon (Newport City Council), M.S. Williams (Caerphilly County Borough Council) J. Thomas (Newport City Council) and J. Wyatt (Vale of Glamorgan Council).

3. MINUTES – 28TH SEPTEMBER 2012

It was agreed that the minutes of the meeting held on 28th September 2012 be approved as a correct record.

Matters Arising:

Since the last meeting some members of the Joint Scrutiny Panel visited the EfW sites run by the two remaining bidders. A number of Members expressed the view that their perception of EfW plants had now changed. The Panel recommended that once the preferred bidder is selected an offer is made to members and community groups to visit a plant run by the preferred bidder.

Mr M Williams reminded members of the question raised at the last meeting on possible changes to dry recycling, from co-mingling to kerbside sorting and the implications for Prosiect Gwyrdd in terms of recycling levels. The perception is that kerbside sorting is a cleaner process but levels of recycling are lower, resulting more material for incineration. He stated that there has been a great deal of debate amongst councils and the WLGA are lobbying Welsh Government.

4. **PRESENTATION: JOINT WORKING AGREEMENT 2**

Mr M. Williams, Project Director, gave Members a presentation on the joint working agreement 2. The new joint working agreement will come into effect once the successful bidder has been appointed.

The main principles and governance arrangements were outlined as follows:

- Minimum and Maximum Tonnage.
- Terminology - Lead Authority to become 'Host Authority' (HA).
- Role: Host Authority (HA).
- Prosiect Gwyrdd Governance.
- Governance Hierarchy.
- Joint Committee (JC).
- Contract Management Board (CMB).
- Contract Management Team (CMT).
- Joint Scrutiny Role and Partnership Representatives Group.
- How and where decisions will be made.

Members asked if the Welsh Government subsidy would be affected if the waste levels dropped below the guaranteed minimum tonnage. Mr Williams stated that the WG subsidy is based on the agreed waste profile which will be paid regardless of tonnage.

Members queried if the profile growth took into account the latest LDP, which predicts significant population increases for Cardiff.

Action: Mr Williams agreed to check if the new LDP figures are included.

Members discussed the need and merits for a Joint Scrutiny Panel to be included as part of the contract governance arrangements. Members agreed the role of the Panel would need to be proportionate and, it was agreed that this issue be brought back for further discussion once the role of the Joint Committee was clarified.

Financial Implications of JWA2

Mr M Falconer outlined the financial implications of JWA2 as follows:

- Financial Clauses
- Annual Budget - All expenditure with the host authority, the JC to 'recommend' budget to partners by the end of December. The costs will be shared equally between Partners.
- Cost Sharing Ratio
- Partner Tonnage -
- Payment Mechanism
- Actual Tonnage

5. **EVALUATION OF SELECTION PROCESS**

Mr M Williams informed the Panel of the following proposed contract award process:

- The recommendation of the preferred bidder to the Project Board on 30 January 2013 to endorse the outcome of the evaluation.
- Joint Committee and Joint Scrutiny Panel informed of the outcome on 1 February 2013 prior to public announcement.
- Joint Committee to meet on 7 February 2013.
- Joint Scrutiny Panel to meet on 13 February 2013.

- Report to Cabinet at individual Councils.
- Full Council meetings week commencing 25 February 2013: Newport City Council 26th February, Caerphilly County Borough Council 27 February 2013, Cardiff Council and Monmouthshire County Borough Council 28th February 2013 and Vale of Glamorgan County Borough Council 6 March 2013.

The meeting closed at 12.06 p.m.